

# **EXHIBIT H**

We are professional political scientists. We write to clarify the evidence in our field for President Trump's claim, which he has repeated several times, that millions of non-citizens voted in the 2016 general election.

The president has cited a 2014 article by Jesse Richman, Gulshan Chattha, and David Earnest, published in the peer-reviewed journal *Electoral Studies*, as evidence for this claim. In that study, Richman and his colleagues used data from the 2008 and 2010 iterations of the Cooperative Congressional Election Study (CCES), a large-scale, regular survey that contained more than 30,000 and 55,000 respondents, respectively. The researchers leveraged questions about respondents' citizenship status and voting to argue that "between 7.9% and 14.7% of non-citizens voted in 2008." Given the non-citizen population of about 19.4 million, the authors concluded, "the number of non-citizen voters... could range from just over 38,000 at the very minimum to nearly 2.8 million at the maximum." The higher bound in this statement is the one that appears to have shaped the president's rhetoric on the issue.

The analysis in this paper has been shown to be incorrect. In a survey as large as the CCES, even a small rate of response error (where people incorrectly mark the wrong item on a survey) can lead to incorrect conclusions. Importantly, the findings in Richman et al. rest on a sample of only 339 respondents who claimed to be non-citizens in 2008, out of about 30,000 CCES respondents. Stephen Ansolabehere, Samantha Luks, and Brian Schaffner demonstrated in a 2015 paper (also published in *Electoral Studies*) that response error explains nearly all of the supposed non-citizens in Richman et al.'s sample who voted. The underlying intuition is relatively straightforward: Given the dynamics of the CCES (a very large overall sample with a very small subpopulation of non-citizens), even with a very low error rate of 0.1%, we would expect roughly 10% of the people in the "non-citizen" category would actually be citizens. If those people then voted at a high rate, it would appear as if a low (but consequential) percentage of non-citizens were voting, which is precisely the result Richman et al. describe.

Indeed, Ansolabehere and colleagues leverage a key feature of the CCES to investigate this possibility. When they examined the responses from people who were asked the citizenship question at two different points in time, they found inconsistencies. The citizenship status of 56 respondents changed in two years, and 20 people reported moving from citizen to non-citizen status (which is not even a plausible change). Of those who we can be more confident are non-citizens, there was not a single voter in 2010. In 2012, there is just one person who may have voted, but even in that case the evidence suggests that the respondent was actually not a voter. Thus, we believe that the findings in Richman et al. are driven by measurement error in the CCES, and do not accurately reflect the rates of non-citizen voting in the United States. We agree with Ansolabehere et al. that "the likely percent of noncitizen voters in recent U.S. elections is 0."

The scholarly political science community has generally rejected the findings in the Richman et al. study and we believe it should not be cited or used in any debate over fraudulent voting.

Signed,

Brian Schaffner, UMass Amherst  
Michael G. Miller, Barnard College  
Laila Sorurbakhsh, American University  
Emmitt Y. Riley III, DePauw University  
Christine Thurlow Brenner, UMass Boston  
Bernard Fraga, Indiana University  
Lawrence Markowitz, Rowan University  
Scott Braam, University of Illinois, Chicago  
Paul Zachary, Emory University  
William Cubbison, George Washington University  
Marc Howard Ross, Bryn Mawr College  
Nathan P. Kalmoe, Louisiana State University  
Steven V. Miller, Clemson University  
Jonathan Ladd, Georgetown University  
Maurice T. Cunningham, UMass Boston  
Jonas Hedegaard Hansen, University of Copenhagen  
Brett L. Carter, University of Southern California  
Yphtach Lelkes, University of Pennsylvania  
Erik Gahner Larsen, University of Southern Denmark  
Jason M. Roberts, University of North Carolina  
Matthew Krain, College of Wooster  
Matthew Jarvis, California State University, Fullerton  
Rebecca Kreitzer, University of North Carolina  
Brent Hierman, Virginia Military Institute  
Alex Street, Carroll College  
Greg Wolf, Colgate University  
Daniel M. Smith, Harvard University  
Derek Kauneckis, Ohio University  
Hans Noel, Georgetown University  
Emily Schilling, University of Tennessee, Knoxville  
Steven S. Smith, Washington University  
David P. Redlawsk, University of Delaware  
Christopher Warshaw, MIT  
James Hedrick, Rice University  
Todd A. Curry, University of Texas, El Paso  
Erin Cikanek, University of Michigan  
Alex Hertel-Fernandez, Columbia University  
Joseph E. Uscinski, University of Miami  
Lynda Dodd City University of New York  
Ariel White, MIT  
Brittany Bramlett, University of Georgia  
Lindsay Nielson, Bucknell University  
David A. M. Peterson, Iowa State University  
Thomas J. Leeper, London School of Economics  
Mike Wagner, University of Wisconsin-Madison  
Dan Cassino, Fairleigh Dickinson University  
Ryan Enos, Harvard University  
Elisabeth Anker, George Washington University  
Eric Juenke, Michigan State University  
Michael Salamone, Washington State University  
Rebecca Hamlin, UMass Amherst  
Justin H. Gross, UMass Amherst  
Philip A. Schrodtt, Parus Analytics  
Eric McLaughlin, University of Redlands  
Miranda Yaver, Yale University  
Leonard Williams, Manchester University  
Rob Goodman, Columbia University  
Greg Hodgin, Georgia State University  
David J. Ciuk, Franklin & Marshall College  
B. Peter Rosendorff, New York University  
Sara Chatfield, University of Denver  
Cali Ellis, University of Southern California  
Salil Benegal, DePauw University  
Christopher Weare, Greater Sacramento Economic Council  
Samuel E. Bestvater, Indiana University  
Michael Tesler, University of California, Irvine  
Boris Heersink, University of Virginia  
Sean Miskell, Syracuse University  
Matthew Sullivan, University of Michigan  
Vanessa Williamson, Brookings Institution  
Robert Mickey, University of Michigan  
Jay Jennings University of Texas at Austin  
Diane E. Yoder, University of Southern California  
Cassandra Khatri, Lone Star College-University Park  
Richard Barton, Cornell University  
Scott Althaus, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign  
Ben Fifield, Princeton University  
Elise Roberts, Syracuse University  
Rob Robinson, California State University, Fullerton  
Nathaniel Birkhead, Kansas State University  
James Newburg, University of Michigan  
Alexander Coppock, Yale University  
Matt W. Loftis, Aarhus University  
Sebastian Karcher, Syracuse University  
Matthew DiGiuseppe, University of Mississippi  
David Doherty, Loyola University Chicago  
Tom Clark, Emory University  
Helen Lindberg, Linnaeus University  
Daniel Schlozman, Johns Hopkins University  
Eric Reinhardt, Emory University  
Guy Grossman, University of Pennsylvania  
Jeffrey Lax, Columbia University  
Robert McGrath, George Mason University  
Cyrus Samii, NYU

Adam Berinsky, MIT  
Chris Bonneau, University of Pittsburgh  
Seth Masket, University of Denver  
Douglas Rice, UMass Amherst  
Sara Mitchell, University of Iowa  
Paul M. Collins, Jr., UMass Amherst  
Alex Garlick, APSA Congressional Fellow  
Holona Ochs, Lehigh University  
Jon Green, Ohio State University  
Thad Dunning, University of California, Berkeley  
Andrew J. Perrin, UNC Chapel Hill  
Bethany Albertson, University of Texas at Austin  
Jeremy Levine, University of Michigan  
John Lovett, University of Richmond  
Patricia Stapleton, Worcester Polytechnic Institute  
Barry Driscoll, Grinnell College  
Juliet Musso, University of Southern California  
Dominic Ciolli, Ohio State University  
Kerry L. Haynie, Duke University  
Jennifer Diascro, University of California, Wash. Center  
Conor M. Dowling, University of Mississippi  
Erica Podrazik, Tulane University  
Jonathon Kingzette, Ohio State University  
Scott Blinder, UMass Amherst  
Athena M. King, Jackson State University  
John Ishiyama, University of North Texas  
Ursula Daxecker, University of Amsterdam  
William Resh, University of Southern California  
Kyle Davis, Ohio State University  
Philip A. Klinkner, Hamilton College  
Brian Hamel, UCLA  
Adam J. Newmark, Appalachian State University  
Alexandra Filindra, University of Illinois, Chicago  
Eric van der Vort, Syracuse University  
Amanda Durso, University of Illinois, Chicago  
Robert Ford, University of Manchester  
Jens Olav Dahlgaard, University of Copenhagen  
Daniel Bowen, The College of New Jersey  
Celia Paris, Loyola University Maryland  
David C. Kershaw, Slippery Rock University  
Kassra A.R. Oskooii, University of Delaware  
Jonathan Cervas, University of California Irvine  
Aaron J. Ley, University of Rhode Island  
Andrew Newman, Ohio State University  
Jocelyn Shadforth, Anne Arundel Community College  
Michael Newell, Syracuse University  
Nathan Carrington, Syracuse University  
Amber Wichowsky, Marquette University  
Matthew Krell, University of Alabama  
Graeme Blair, UCLA  
Dwayne Jengolley, Purdue University  
Matthew R. Miles, BYU-Idaho  
Ngoc Phan, Davidson College  
Hans Hassell, Cornell College  
Sercan Canbolat, University of Connecticut  
Eric Oliver, University of Chicago  
Dr. Ryan Jablonski, London School of Economics  
Jennifer Nicoll Victor, George Mason University  
Tom Waters, Comm. Svc. Soc. of New York  
Clifford James Carrubba, Emory University  
Ian R. Turner, Texas A&M University  
Matthew L. Bergbower, Indiana State University  
Matty Robin, Cardlytics  
Melissa Sands, Harvard University  
Matt Levendusky, University of Pennsylvania  
Michael Leo Owens, Emory University  
Michael F. Seese, University of California, San Diego  
Costas Panagopoulos, Fordham University  
Joseph W. Roberts, Roger Williams University  
Alexander W. Severson, Florida State University  
Allen Hicken, University of Michigan  
Rebecca Reid, University of Texas at El Paso  
Eliza J. Willis, Grinnell College  
Luke Keele, Georgetown  
Anthony Madonna, University of Georgia  
Denise Walsh, University of Virginia  
Bernard Brennan, University of Illinois  
John Mollenkopf, The Graduate Center, CUNY  
Brandon Kendhammer, Ohio University  
William Schultz, Florida State University  
Kris-Stella Trump, Harvard Medical School  
Nandini Deo, Lehigh University  
Rebecca Best, University of Missouri at Kansas City  
Kim Moloney, American University  
Christopher M. Federico, University of Minnesota  
Kirk A. Randazzo, University of South Carolina  
Adriano Udani, University of Missouri-St. Louis  
Stefan Müller, Trinity College Dublin  
Jessica Trounstine, University of California, Merced  
Daniel de Kadt, MIT  
Keith Gaddie, The University of Oklahoma  
Yamil Velez, Wesleyan University  
Emily Farris, Texas Christian University  
Shana Gadarian, Syracuse University  
Tom Pepinsky, Cornell University  
Michael P. Fix, Georgia State University  
Angela X. Ocampo, UCLA  
Bradford S. Jones, University of California, Davis